The Anxiety of Influence and Appropriation

The Seventh Biennial Bryn Mawr College Graduate Group Symposium

December 4-5, 2009

**Featured Respondent:** Robert Nelson, Robert Lehman Professor, History of Art, Yale University

Sponsored by the Graduate Group, the Center for Visual Culture, and the Departments of Classical and Near Eastern Archaeology, Greek, Latin and Classical Studies, and History of Art

---

**GRADUATE GROUP SYMPOSIUM**

This symposium offers an interdisciplinary engagement of thievery, appropriation, and influence as creative strategies. Selected graduate students will deliver papers from a variety of disciplines and Professor Robert Nelson, Yale University, will offer remarks and response. Professor Nelson has written widely within his own field of medieval art, but his concerns extend to a broader discourse on the history and methods of art history. His books include *Hagia Sophia 1850-1950: Holy Wisdom Modern Monument* (2004) and *Later Byzantine Painting: Art, Agency, and Appreciation* (2007). As co-editor of *Critical Terms for Art History* (2003), Professor Nelson authored the entry on appropriation.
Imitation is supposed to be the highest form of flattery, but we're only told this to quell our anxieties about loss of originality, loss of ownership, and even loss of identity. But don't all forms of cultural expression exhibit some type of imitation? As Jonathan Letham observes, "appropriation, mimicry, quotation, allusion, and sublimated collaboration consist of a kind of sine qua non of the creative act."

Taken further, thievery is inherent to creative practice. How might thinking about theft, even blatant acts of looting or plagiarism, allow us to recognize subtler forms of thievery, such as influence or appropriation, as creative practices? If we think about appropriation as a form of theft, we can insist on the intentions that motivate appropriative acts, instead of assuming an otherwise passive chain of arbitrary influences—a distinction that might already be staged by the words "appropriation" and "influence." Doing so might also allow us to re-imagine appropriation not just as a simple one-way transmission, but as a complex process of exchanges through which new meanings can adhere to and even displace an "original intention."

This interdisciplinary symposium invites graduate students in Classics, Archaeology, History of Art, and related fields to present papers that address creative or historical acts of appropriation, theories of origin and copy, as well as the cultural reception of such acts. Topics might include: intertextuality, plagiarism/quotation/glossing, intellectual property, the question of authorship, mimicry, modern and post-modern artistic strategies such as collage, found-object, or found-footage, cultural revivals (neo-isms), historiography of style, cultural imperialism, collecting, spolia, looting, et al.

The symposium committee has extended the deadline and will be accepting and reviewing submissions throughout the summer. Please submit abstracts of less than 250 words. Electronic submission to bmcsymposium@gmail.com will be preferred. Otherwise, please submit a paper copy to:

Bryn Mawr Graduate Student Symposium  
c/o Johanna Gosse, Box 1646  
Bryn Mawr College  
101 North Merion Ave.  
Bryn Mawr, PA 19010
The Anxiety of Influence and Appropriation
The Seventh Biennial Bryn Mawr College Graduate Group Symposium

December 4-5, 2009

Featured Respondent: Robert Nelson, Robert Lehman Professor, History of Art, Yale University

Sponsored by the Graduate Group, the Center for Visual Culture and the Departments of Classical and Near Eastern Archaeology, Greek, Latin and Classical Studies, and History of Art

SCHEDULE

Friday, December 4

2:00 - 4:00 pm
Registration, Carpenter Library

4:00 - 4:30 pm
Tea, Quita Woodward Room

4:30 - 5:45 pm
Roundtable - A CONSIDERATION OF DISCIPLINARY CONCERNS

Roundtable discussion led by Bryn Mawr College Graduate Group Student Representatives:

- Joelle Collins
  "Roman Copies, Greek Originals and Modern Perceptions -- A Historiography of Ancient Roman Sculpture"

- Matthew Feliz
  "Raiding the Archive: An Art Historical Perspective on Appropriation"

- Jessica Sisk
  "Sons of Hermes: Translation, Theft, and Classical Studies"

6:00 - 7:00 pm
Reception in the Rare Book Room, Canaday Library
## Saturday, December 5
9:00 am to 5:30 pm

*All events are scheduled in Carpenter Library B21 unless otherwise noted.*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Event</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:15 - 9:00 am</td>
<td>Breakfast Gathering, Quita Woodward Room</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00 - 9:10 am</td>
<td>Welcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Carrie Robbins and Johanna Gosse, co-chairs, Symposium Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:10 - 9:45 am</td>
<td>Opening Remarks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Professor Robert Nelson, Yale University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:45 - 11:00 am</td>
<td><strong>SESSION 1 - LOOTING: RETHINKING LOSS OF OWNERSHIP</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
|              | Stella Diakou: Department of Classical and Near Eastern Archaeology, Bryn Mawr College  
|              | “From Tomb Robbers to Private Collectors: Thievery of Cultural Heritage in the 21st Century”  |
|              | Nicholas Genau: Graduate Program in the History of Art and Architecture, University of Virginia  
|              | “An Appropriation of Victory: Calixtus II and Spolia at Santa Maria in Cosmedin”  |
|              | Jasmine Cloud: Art History Department, Temple University               
|              | “Damage Control: The Façade of San Marco and the Western Response to the Fourth Crusade”  |
| 11:00 - 11:15 am | Coffee Break, Quita Woodward Room                                    |
| 11:15 am - 1:00 pm | **SESSION 2 - COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT: RETHINKING LOSS OF ORIGINALITY**|
|              | Daniel Dooley: Department of Classics, Johns Hopkins University       
|              | “Epicizing Epigrams and Epigrammatic Epics: Homeric Elements in Hellenistic Poetry”  |
|              | Melanie Subacus: Department of Classics, New York University          
|              | “Translation and Appropriation of Vergil’s Aeneid”                    |
|              | Catherine Roach                                                       |
Department of Art History and Archaeology, Columbia University

"'The Want of Artifice': Allusion and Inclusion in Eighteenth-Century British Painting"

- Nate Harrison
  Visual Arts Department, University of California, San Diego
  "The Pictures Movement, the Copyright Act of 1976, and the Reassertion of Authorship in Postmodernity"

1:00 - 2:15 pm
Lunch, Dorothy Vernon Room in Haffner Hall

2:15 - 3:30 pm
SESSION 3 - IDENTITY THEFT: RETHINKING LOSS OF IDENTITY

- Laura Pfuntner
  Graduate Group in Ancient History and Mediterranean Archaeology, University of California
  "Creating Commagenian Kingship at Nemrud Dagi"

- Taylor Coughlan
  Department of Classics, University of Cincinnati
  "'Parroting' Ovid: Sappho, Voice and Poetic Influence in Heroides 15"

- James Magruder
  Department of History of Art, Johns Hopkins University
  "The Late Byzantine Cameo and New Visions of Old Rome"

3:30 - 3:45 pm
Coffee Break, Quita Woodward Room

3:45 - 5:00 pm
SESSION 4 - HISTORY AS THEFT: RETHINKING DERIVATION, ECLECTICISM, AND NARRATIVE

- Jessica Seidman
  Department of Classical Languages and Literatures, University of Chicago
  "Modeling on 'Zeuxis Selecting Models': Catullus 51 and the Aesthetic of Eclecticism"

- Dan Leon
  Department of Classics, University of Virginia
  "Who Wrote Arrian's Anabasis? Source Criticism and the Destruction of Coherent Texts"

- Zhanara Nauruzbayeva
  Department of Anthropology, Stanford University
  "Derivative Modernisms: Appropriation and Visual Artists in Post-Soviet Kazakhstan"

- Ruth Erickson
  History of Art Department, University of Pennsylvania
  "The Real Movie: Reenactment, Spectacle, and Recovery in Pierre Huyghe's The Third Memory"
The Anxiety of Influence and Appropriation
The Seventh Biennial Bryn Mawr College Graduate Group Symposium

December 4-5, 2009

Featured Respondent: Robert Nelson, Robert Lehman Professor, History of Art, Yale University

Sponsored by the Graduate Group, the Center for Visual Culture, and the Departments of Classical and Near Eastern Archaeology, Greek, Latin and Classical Studies, and History of Art

PARTICIPANTS

Jasmine Cloud
Temple University
“Damage Control: The Façade of San Marco and the Western Response to the Fourth Crusade”

Jasmine Cloud is a 3rd-year PhD Art History student at Temple University in Philadelphia. She received her MA from the University of Colorado - Boulder. Her research interests focus on the late sixteenth and seventeenth centuries with a special interest in the Paleochristian revival of the post-Tridentine Church.

Joelle Collins
Bryn Mawr College
“Roman Copies, Greek Originals and Modern Perceptions -- A Historiography of Ancient Roman Sculpture”

Joelle Collins earned her B.A. in Biology from the University of Pennsylvania in 1989 and worked for a number of years as a research technician in the Department of Human Genetics at the Children's Hospital of Philadelphia. In 2002, she completed an M.A. in the History of Art at Bryn Mawr College. Currently, Joelle is a Ph.D. candidate in Bryn Mawr's Department of Classical and Near Eastern Archaeology. Her dissertation, “Art as Commodity in the Roman World,” focuses on Roman sculpture used in domestic spaces from the 1st century BCE to the end of the 2nd century CE.

Taylor Coughlan
University of Cincinnati
““Parroting’ Ovid: Sappho, Voice and Poetic Influence in Heroides 15”

Taylor Coughlan graduated with a BA in Classical Languages from Carleton College in 2006 and an MA from the University of Wisconsin-Madison in 2009. He was a 2006 winner of the John J. Winkler Memorial Prize for a paper
on the creation of gender identities in the Salmacis-Hermaphroditus episode in book four of Ovid's *Metamorphoses*. Currently, he is a 1st year PhD student at the University of Cincinnati.

**Stella Diakou**

*Bryn Mawr College*

"From Tomb Robbers to Private Collectors: Thievery of Cultural Heritage in the 21st Century"

Stella Diakou completed her undergraduate degree at the University of Cyprus (2001-2005) in the Department of History and Archaeology. She received her MA in Archaeology at Bryn Mawr College in May 2008 (Middle Bronze Age Cyprus: a reassessment of the evidence with an emphasis on the circulation of Middle Cypriot pottery). During the 2008-2009 school year, she was the Emily Townsend Vermeule fellow at the American School of Classical Studies in Athens. She has been excavating since 2002 in both Cyprus and Greece. Stella plans to complete her preliminary examinations in April 2010 and begin working on her dissertation.

**Daniel Dooley**

*Johns Hopkins University*

"Epicizing Epigrams and Epigrammatic Epics: Homeric Elements in Hellenistic Poetry"

Daniel Dooley is a second-year graduate student in the Department of Classics at Johns Hopkins University. His primary interests are still broad: Greek texts and the development of the Greek language from the Archaic through Late Antique periods. He has studied the Greek language from the perspective of historical linguistics and with respect to its diffusion during the Hellenistic and Roman eras. Originally from Fairfax, VA, he graduated with a BA in Classics from the University of Virginia.

**Ruth Erickson**

*University of Pennsylvania*

"The Real Movie: Reenactment, Spectacle, and Recovery in Pierre Huyghe’s *The Third Memory*"

Ruth Erickson is a third year graduate student in art history at the University of Pennsylvania. Her research focuses on modern and contemporary art, with specific interest in film and performance, art collectives, institutional critique, and social art practices. Her dissertation explores art collectives in post-1968 Paris. From 2004-2007, she was Curator at the Firehouse Gallery, Burlington, VT, where she organized over two-dozen exhibitions.

**Matthew Feliz**

*Bryn Mawr College*

"Raiding the Archive: An Art Historical Perspective on Appropriation"

Matthew Feliz is graduate student in History of Art where he is specializing in Modern and Contemporary Art. He recently completed his MA thesis on the Belgian artist Marcel Broodthaers. He organized an exhibition for Bryn Mawr College that used objects from the college collections to explore the role of optical toys and devices within 19th century visual culture. He works on video art and is currently researching the video works of contemporary artist Christian Marclay.

**Nicholas Genau**

*University of Virginia*

"An Appropriation of Victory: Calixtus II and Spolia at Santa Maria in Cosmedin"

Nicholas Genau is a first year PhD student in the department of History of Art and Architecture at the University of Virginia, where he also received his MA in 2009 and BA in 2006. His current scholarly interests include the reception of classical texts and tradition in the Middle Ages, literary descriptions of cities, twelfth century Rome, travel writing and guidebooks, memory and imitation, spolia, nineteenth and early twentieth century American architecture.
Nate Harrison

University of California, San Diego

"The Pictures Movement, the Copyright Act of 1976, and the Reassertion of Authorship in Postmodernity"

Nate Harrison is an artist and writer working at the intersection of intellectual property, cultural production, and the formation of creative processes in modern media. He has produced projects and exhibited for The American Museum of Natural History, The Whitney Museum of American Art, The Los Angeles County Museum of Art, The Kunstverein in Hamburg, and The Museum of Contemporary Art, Denver, among others. Nate has lectured at the University of Rochester, Experience Music Project in Seattle, and the University of Glasgow, among others. Nate co-directed the project space ESTHETICS AS A SECOND LANGUAGE (www.eslprojects.org) from 2004-2008. He earned a Bachelor of Fine Arts from the University of Michigan, a Master of Fine Arts from California Institute of the Arts, and is currently a doctoral candidate in Art and Media History, Theory, and Criticism in the Visual Arts Department at the University of California, San Diego. Currently, Nate is working on his dissertation and teaching at the School of the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston; he lives in Brooklyn, New York.

Dan Leon

University of Virginia

"Who Wrote Arrian's Anabasis? Source Criticism and the Destruction of Coherent Texts"

Dan Leon is a PhD student at the University of Virginia; he received two MA degrees in Greek and Latin from the University of Michigan and a BA in Classical Languages from Macalester College. He is currently working on a dissertation on Arrian's Anabasis. Dan spent the last school year at the American School of Classical Studies at Athens. He will present, "Who Wrote Arrian's Anabasis? Source Criticism and the Destruction of Coherent Texts."

James Magruder, III

Johns Hopkins University

"Counterfeiting Romanitas in Late Byzantine & Medieval Cameos"

James Magruder, III received a BA in Russian language and literature with honors from Grinnell College. After several years of work in distance education and academic computing, he decided to pursue a profession in art history. A master's degree in Eastern Orthodox studies resulted in a thesis on the illuminations of the Sinope Gospels. His doctoral study at Johns Hopkins University has increasingly focused on the problematics of Byzantine sculpture, materiality, and the icon. Jamie is currently writing a dissertation that deals with Byzantine gems and marble relief icons from a variety of contexts, including theology, magic, economics, and literature.

Zhanara Nauruzbayeva

Stanford University

"Derivative Modernisms: Appropriation and Visual Artists in Post-Soviet Kazakhstan"

Zhanara Nauruzbayeva is a cultural anthropologist and has conducted fieldwork research with visual artists in Almaty, Kazakhstan in 2006-2007. She is a PhD student in the department of Anthropology at Stanford University. Her dissertation explores how visual artists, who had come of age during the Soviet period, adapt to the market economy in post-socialist Kazakhstan. She is also a member of the art collective "Artpologist" that combines art and anthropology.

Laura Pfuntner

University of California, Berkeley

"Creating Commagenian Kingship at Nemrud Dagi"

Laura Pfuntner is a 4th year PhD student in the Graduate Group in Ancient History and Mediterranean Archaeology at the University of California, Berkeley. Her scholarly interests include the history and historiography of the Roman Empire and the art and archaeology of the Hellenistic Eastern Mediterranean. She received her BA in
Catherine Roach

*Columbia University*

**"The Want of Artifice": Allusion and Inclusion in Eighteenth-Century British Painting**

Catherine Roach is a PhD student in the department of Art History and Archaeology at Columbia University. After graduating this semester, she will join the department of the History of Art at Cornell University as a Postdoctoral Associate in January. Articles based on chapters of her dissertation, "Frame Works: Paintings-within-Paintings in Nineteenth Century Britain," have recently been published in the British Art Journal and Visual Culture in Britain. She is also working on an exhibition, "Seeing Double: Portraits, Copies, and Exhibitions in 1820s London," which will be at the Yale Center for British Art, New Haven, June 23-September 19, 2010.

Jessica Seidman

*University of Chicago*

**"Modeling on 'Zeuxis Selecting Models': Catullus 51 and the Aesthetic of Eclecticism"**

Jessica Seidman is a fourth year graduate student in Classical Languages and Literatures at the University of Chicago. She received her BA in Latin and Greek from Brown University in 2002 and her MA in Classical Languages and Literatures from the University of Chicago in 2008. Her current research interests include Roman concepts of originality in poetry and art and narrativity in Latin lyric poetry. Some recent papers include "'Sceclus est Pietas': Pietas and Incest in Ovid’s 'Proene and Tereus," (CAMWS 2008) and "Annales I.61: A Tacitean Ecphrasis and Its Modern Legacy," (Rhetoric and Poetics Workshop, University of Chicago, May 2008).

Jessica Sisk

*Bryn Mawr College*

**"Sons of Hermes: Translation, Theft, and Classical Studies"**

Jessica M. Sisk earned her undergraduate degree in Classics at Indiana University, Bloomington and also holds an MA in Greek and Latin from Bryn Mawr College (Herodotus and The Natural World, 2006). During the last two years she taught several courses in Greek and Latin at the University of Delaware. She is currently at work on a dissertation regarding women’s non-kin relationships in antiquity.

Melanie Subacus

*New York University*

**"Translation and Appropriation of Vergil’s Aeneid"**

Melanie Subacus is a third year PhD candidate in the department of Classics at New York University. She received her BA in Latin from Saint Joseph’s University in 2007. She attended the Intercollegiate Center for Classical Studies in Rome in the spring of 2006. A collaborative translation of Propertius 2.33B will be published in the Norton Pocket Book of Writing by Students (forthcoming 2010). Her interests include Latin epic, translation theory, and gender studies.
The Anxiety of Influence and Appropriation
The Seventh Biennial Bryn Mawr College Graduate Group Symposium

December 4-5, 2009

Featured Respondent: Robert Nelson, Robert Lehman Professor, History of Art, Yale University

Sponsored by the Graduate Group, the Center for Visual Culture, and the Departments of Classical and Near Eastern Archaeology, Greek, Latin and Classical Studies, and History of Art

EVENT INFORMATION

The Graduate Group embraces three departments: Classical & Near Eastern Archaeology, Greek, Latin, & Classical Studies, and History of Art. Faculty and students in the three departments share space and resources in the Rhys Carpenter Library and collaborate in many scholarly, professional, and social activities.

The biennial Graduate Student Symposium is one the Graduate Group's significant shared enterprises at Bryn Mawr. Organized entirely by students, these ambitious symposia attract graduate students from all over the United States and from other countries to contribute papers on such interdisciplinary themes as "Thievery: The Anxiety of Influence and Appropriation" (2009); "To the Ends of the Earth: Journeys Ancient to Modern" (2007); "After Death and Afterlife: The End or Beginning?" (2005).

- Arriving to Bryn Mawr Campus

Click here for campus maps and further information about the college.

- Accommodations

On campus, Bryn Mawr College offers accommodations at Wyndham Alumnae House. Rooms are in limited supply, so please contact them early (610-526-5236).

Several hotels in the vicinity of Bryn Mawr College are listed below, for those participants who need accommodations.

The Radnor Hotel
591 East Lancaster Avenue
St. Davids, PA 19087
610-688-5800
$119-$139 per night with local college discount
A 10-minute drive from campus and within walking distance to restaurants

The Wayne Hotel
139 East Lancaster Avenue
Wayne, PA 19087
610-687-5000
$139 per night with local college discount
A 15-minute drive from campus and within walking distance to shopping, movies, and restaurants

**Philadelphia Marriott West**
111 Crawford Avenue
West Conshohocken, PA 19428
610-941-5600
$95-$130 per night
A 7-minute drive from campus

**Residence Inn Conshohocken by Marriott**
191 Washington Street
Conshohocken, PA 19428
610-828-8800
$119 per night (suite)
A 10-minute drive from campus

We may also be able to arrange a home-stay with a graduate student for Friday and/or Saturday nights. You will need to be in contact with him/her in advance of your arrival. If you would like to have a home-stay arranged, please email bmcsymposium@gmail.com.

- **Where to Eat**

  Lunch and dinner will be provided for student speakers on Saturday. Guests of Speakers and Bryn Mawr College Graduate Students are welcome to attend Saturday's dinner at a cost of $20. Please send a check before November 13 to:

  Nickie Colosimo
  Bryn Mawr College
  101 N Merion Ave, C# 16-14
  Bryn Mawr, PA 19010

  - **Bryn Mawr Campus**
    - Uncommon Grounds
  
  - **Within Walking Distance of Bryn Mawr Campus**
    - Cosi
    - Bertucci's
    - Ha Long Bay
    - The Grog Bar and Grill
    - Mediterranean Grill
    - Verdad Tapas and Wine Bar
    - Sushiland
Jasmine Cloud  
*Temple University*

"*Damage Control: The Façade of San Marco and the Western Response to the Fourth Crusade*"

Scholars have interpreted the renovation of San Marco and its piazza in the thirteenth century as a visual performance of Venice's authority and legitimacy after 1204. Although indeed a manifestation of the city's pride, the redecoration of the façade of San Marco, with Byzantine spoils from the Latin Empire and new mosaics, also declared Venice's position pertaining to its actions in the Fourth Crusade. That is, the Venetians publicly asserted their right to the spoils of Constantinople in the face of critics who considered their actions barbaric and unjust. The western response to the taking of Constantinople vacillated between blaming the papacy and questioning the intentions of the Venetians. Venice answered this through the decoration of its most prominent civic space and the contemporary chronicle of Martin da Canal in the 1260s. Canal's chronicle features two critical elements in this response: the first Venetian version of the events in the Levant and the reformulation and codification of the Marcian legend. The thirteenth-century façade mosaics of the translation of the body of St. Mark from Alexandria reminded the viewer of Venice's prior legitimate acts of *furta sacra* (sacred theft). As shown by Thomas E. A. Dale, Venice had previously used visual means to assert its primacy over Aquileia. The concurrent revision of the Marcian legend and the redecoration of the church functioned as a response to those uneasy about the actions of Venice and the Crusaders in the Latin Empire, and asserted Venice's legitimate ownership of the spoils.

Taylor Coughlan  
*University of Cincinnati*

‘*Parroting’ Ovid: Sappho, Voice, and Poetic Influence in Heroides 15*’

Ovid's *Heroides* 15—the letter from the abandoned lyric poet Sappho to her lover Phaon—is a unique example in extant ancient literature of one author consciously writing in the voice of another. As such, *Heroides* 15 has become a central text in recent studies of the Ovidian poetics of imitation and allusion, especially the relationship between the elegiac *persona* and the literary canon (Verducci 1985; Davis 2005; Rimell 2006). This paper explores the poetic tension between writing in the voice of another poet and maintaining poetic originality. I will argue that Ovid exploits this tension—namely, the expectation of allusion to Sappho—to affirm the innovation and primacy of his poetic program.
At *Heroides* 15. 110-16, Ovid has Sappho recount to Phaon her physical reaction to his absence. For any reader familiar with Sappho’s oeuvre these lines would immediately evoke the pathos of Sappho’s original lyric (fr. 31. 7-10). While the context is reminiscent of Sappho, the language used by Ovid’s Sappho to describe her symptoms recall, instead, the lines of Ovid’s own *Amores* 2.6 in which he describes the final words and actions of Corinna’s parrot, who represents a metaphor for the elegiac poetic persona (Boyd 1987). Indeed, throughout *Heroides* 15 we find allusions to *Amores* 2.6 in the place of Sapphic tropes or language. This repeated self-allusion—a literary bait-and-switch of sorts—completely undermines the initial poetic conceit of *Heroides* 15: i.e. Ovid writing in the voice of Sappho. Instead, Sappho, stripped of her lyric voice, becomes another elegiac parrot, and the result is a questioning of the reliance on allusions to canonical texts for poetic success (cf. Catullus 51 and Horace Odes. 1.13 on Sappho fr. 31).

**Selected bibliography**


---

**Stella Diakou**

*Bryn Mawr College*

"From Tomb Robbers to Private Collectors: Thievery of Cultural Heritage in the 21st Century"

Thievery, “the committing or practice of theft,” of art and antiquities has been a common theme since ancient times. However, during the last 20 years, along with an increasing anxiety on the subject of cultural heritage, there has also been an expansion in the relevant literature. Archaeologists, art historians and other scholars have become more aware of the theft of cultural heritage that continues to take place even in the 21st century.

The preservation, protection and promotion of cultural heritage appears to be the aim of almost all interested parties. In this paper I will look at the issues that are at stake here: who is the owner of cultural heritage? What constitutes legal ownership of cultural heritage? How does the term cultural property fit in the relevant discussions? What is the role of source and demand countries in the continuous stealing of cultural heritage? Who supplies the black market in art and antiquities? What is the role of museums, auction houses and private collectors in the preservation and protection of cultural heritage?

These issues will be presented against the background of the legal framework for the protection of cultural heritage. Using specific examples I will look at the development of this legal framework at an international and national level. Moreover, I will examine the evolution of museums’ acquisition policies and codes of ethics and how these influence the demand for art and antiquities.

---

**Daniel Dooley**

*Johns Hopkins University*

"Epicizing Epigrams and Epigrammatic Epics: Homeric Elements in Hellenistic Poetry"

The little-known epigrammatist Pollianus plainly proclaimed his hatred for imitators of Homer, whom he considered plagiarists, mere “robbers of another’s verses” (λωποδ?τας ?Λλοτρ?ων ?η?ων, Anthologia Palatina 11.130). This sentiment was widespread during the Hellenistic period, when Callimachus and some of his contemporaries championed succinct, original compositions over long-winded works that borrowed copiously from the epic tradition. However, such contemporary criticism ignored the fact that just as Hellenistic sculpture almost depended on its ability to respond to archaic motifs, Homer’s influence was practically inescapable within the Hellenistic literary milieu (cf. Fowler, 156ff.). Moreover, the appropriation of Homeric elements was not equivalent to straight plagiarism, as epic material was in fact heavily reworked during this period.

This paper explores the various borrowings and transformations of Homer through the lens of three case studies. First, Callimachus, despite his professed aversion to epic, is studied for his learned adaptations of Homeric language and imagery. By contrast, Apollonius Rhodius adopted the formal appearance of epic verse for his
Argonautica, but he simultaneously drew upon Attic tragedy and achieved further novelty through his untraditional portrayal of Jason. Finally, Homer’s texts formed the basis for the mythological and topographical allusions of Euphorion, an author who in late Republican Rome was both revered and defamed for his exuberance. Far from finding Homer’s Hellenistic imitators guilty of unoriginality, we should recognize and appreciate the diversity of uses to which these poets applied their ancient model.

Selected bibliography

Ruth Erickson
*University of Pennsylvania*

"The Real Movie: Reenactment, Spectacle, and Recovery in Pierre Huyghe’s *The Third Memory*

Reenactment has emerged as a key artistic strategy in recent years. It operates through the mechanism of repetition and alienation, where the reconstruction of a source event entails that event’s transformation. For the most part, contemporary artists deploy reenactment for two critical purposes: to “rewrite” history by offering a forum for other viewpoints traditionally kept outside the “grand narratives” and to deconstruct the images and accounts that have comprised these narratives. These aims are central to what Robert Blackson calls reenactment’s “emancipatory agency.” However, as much as reenactments may correct the passivity of mediation and representation with the action of enactment, they also rely on the production of new images to re-produce events. This paper situates reenactment within histories of performance and appropriation and, through Pierre Huyghe’s *The Third Memory* (2000), explores how this technology of representation manipulates pre-existing cultural forms and knowledge.

To create *The Third Memory*, Huyghe invited John Wojtowicz to direct a reenactment of his attempted bank robbery twenty-eight years after its occurrence. Widely covered by the media from the outset, the robbery had become inextricably linked with, if not eclipsed by, the popular Hollywood film based on the event—*Dog Day Afternoon* (US, 1975). To reenact the robbery, therefore, meant to reenact the robbery’s mediatization and cinematic narrativization, thereby producing a new form, a third memory, distinct from journalistic fact and Hollywood fiction yet influenced by these prior representations. By analyzing these films as well as a 2004 documentary about the robbery, *Based on a True Story*, I trace a series of reenactments and argue that Huyghe uses the tactic to mediate between recovery and spectacle.

Nicholas Genau
*University of Virginia*

"An Appropriation of Victory: Calixtus II and Spolia at Santa Maria in Cosmedin"

Throughout its fertile history, Santa Maria in Cosmedin in Rome has been an architectural emblem of various historical, religious, and political individuals and groups. Although not as monumental as the major pilgrimage churches of Rome or equally significant basilicae, Santa Maria in Cosmedin reflects certain contemporary trends in architectural and artistic programs expressed in the more famous churches throughout the city. Upon entering the basilica, the astute visitor is immediately struck by the heterogeneous collection of capitals, shafts, and bases that constitute the colonnade of the nave. Most exceptional are two historiated capitals displaying personifications of Genii and Victories, which, as examples of spolia, teem with exegetical significance, especially in consideration of the twelfth century renovation of the church. This paper first argues that these two historiated capitals were taken from the Altar Maxima Herculis Victoris, one of the most sacred sites in ancient Rome, over which Santa Maria in Cosmedin was built. Based on the association of the church with the Great Altar, therefore, it will become clear that the capitals served as symbols of the church’s twelfth century patron, Pope Calixtus II, whose papacy (1119-24) marked the end of the Investiture Conflict, fought between the Roman Church and the Holy Roman Empire over the right of investiture, or the appointment of bishops. Thus, Calixtus, in appropriating
Santa Maria in Cosmedin and its spolia into his fledgling political sphere, was continuing a centuries long tradition of evoking Hercules as a symbol of victory, as well as furthering the political mode in twelfth century Rome of retranslating the pagan past into present Christian ideologies.

Nate Harrison
University of California, San Diego

"The Pictures Movement, the Copyright Act of 1976, and the Reassertion of Authorship in Postmodernity"

This paper will reevaluate Sherrie Levine’s and Richard Prince’s early appropriations within the context of their poststructuralist theorization, and in particular the “death of the author” discourse historically linked with the avant-garde activities of New York’s Pictures Movement. Held at Soho’s Artists Space in the Fall of 1977, Douglas Crimp’s exhibition Pictures (after which the movement is named), is often cited as the inauguration of postmodern appropriation and its critique of the centered author-subject—a figure rigorously defended in modern art history through to Abstract Expressionism. Rather than maintain the exhibition as a founding moment however, this essay will instead situate the beginnings of postmodern appropriation within the context of legal history, linking it to an event that preceded Pictures by a year: the passing of the Copyright Act of 1976. Doing so will enlarge appropriation art’s social, economic and political framing, which in turn can assist in more thoroughly analyzing the theoretical moment within which appropriation art has been historicized. The paper will conclude that, given American copyright law’s de-individuation of the author, Levine’s and Prince’s gestures invite a reading at odds with a poststructuralist critique. Rather than undermining any romantic notion of authorial originality in a culture of the copy, the works reasserted the very productive core of the romantic authorial mode—one premised on the author’s singular ownership of the work through his or her labor.

Dan Leon
University of Virginia

"Who Wrote Arrian’s Anabasis? Source Criticism and the Destruction of Coherent Texts"

Though it is a complete text, Arrian’s Anabasis has been divided into fragments of texts assigned to earlier authors by generations of scholars attempting to reconstruct the lost histories of Alexander the Great. Such texts are sought as ‘superior’ historical sources (Tarn, Bosworth 1988) or as representatives of Hellenistic historiography (Pearson, Tonnet). While pursuing these goals, scholars have effectively obliterated Arrian’s role as author of the Anabasis by stressing the presence of material composed by other authors.

The perceived theft of Alexander’s horse (Anabasis 5.19.6) is one incident which source criticism has not explained adequately. Though the story involves Alexander’s genocidal rage, scholarship has focused on the lost source (Powell) or on the geographical problems presented by Arrian’s slight divergence from other accounts (Bosworth, ad loc.). This approach has revealed that all extant accounts share a source, but ignores Arrian’s manipulation of it.

In this paper I will demonstrate that, by relating the incident out of its proper chronological sequence and alongside Alexander’s grief at the horse’s death, Arrian creates a pair of episodes addressing the tension between Alexander’s military prowess and his inability to conquer death, a prominent theme in the Anabasis (cf. Stadter, pp. 86-88). Through this case study, I will suggest an alternative approach the text which highlights Arrian’s agency in the selection, adaptation, and presentation of his material. I will also demonstrate that the fragments contained in the Anabasis cannot be understood without reference to Arrian’s deployment of them, a conclusion which may have implications for other texts often considered ‘derivative’ historiography.

Bibliography
Bosworth, A.B. A Historical Commentary on Arrian’s History of Alexander (2 vols.). Oxford, 1980-
Pearson, L. The Lost Histories of Alexander the Great. New York, 1960
Stadter, P. Arrian of Nicomedia. Chapel Hill, 1980
The world of personal and precious objects that engaged a freewheeling discourse of sacred and secular Romanness, fantasized and constructed. If imitation is the sincerest form of flattery, then revival is the subtlest form of thievery.

My paper presents an ethnography of "alternative modernisms." Research with contemporary visual artists in post-socialist Kazakhstan revealed the important disparity of how Kazakhstani artists understood their own work in relation to how art interlocutors from outside Kazakhstan perceived the same work. Kazakhstani artists, effectively sealed off from the Western art world until the collapse of the Soviet Union, now consider themselves, in profound ways, as part of a global community of artists. Nonetheless, the most common term that their art encounters with art interlocutors outside Kazakhstan is "derivative." Because most of the works produced by these artists is in a dialogue with the Western modernist tradition, their work is considered to have little unique contribution to the global history of art.

In this paper, I explore this divergence by focusing on appropriation as a creative practice. I investigate the social processes that shape how Kazakhstani visual artists come to understand their art-making as engaging with Western artists through interviews with two painters who produce their work in relation to French artist Jean Dubuffet and American artist Keith Haring. Their accounts offer an example of how post-Soviet artists establish intellectual kinship and affinity to a transnational community. As such, this paper presents artists’ counternarratives to the hegemonic claims built into the category of ‘alternative modernisms.’

The tumulus of the Commagenian king Antiochus I at Nemrud Dagi (ca. 69 – 31 BC) is one of the most confounding monuments of the Hellenistic period. Built on a mountaintop high in the Taurus range, the monument’s sculptural program draws from the iconography of the Greek and Iranian religious traditions upon which Antiochus based his dynastic cult, yet the form and style of the images of Antiochus, his ancestors, and his gods are without close parallel in either tradition. Terms such as "syncretism" or "hybridity" are usually used to describe the monument’s relationship to Hellenistic Greek and Ancient Near Eastern art. However, these terms imply a simple blending of similar elements from static Greek and Near Eastern traditions, and do not leave room
for change within traditions. They are also rather restrictive, since they do not account for the motivations of Antiochus in appropriating and manipulating tradition or explain why he might have chosen to depart completely from it in some instances.

This paper instead approaches Nemrud Dagi as an expression of Antiochus’ ambitions for himself and his dynasty, and as a creative answer to the special challenges he faced in promoting a dynastic cult in the turbulent late Hellenistic world. By drawing from (but not adhering faithfully to) the artistic traditions of the Hellenistic kingdoms and Achaemenid Persia, Antiochus promoted a new and distinct conception of Commagenian kingship that looked to the distant, imagined past rather than the troubled present in order to emphasize the beneficence, inclusiveness, concord and stability of his reign.

_Catherine Roach_
*Columbia University*

"'The Want of Artifice’: Allusion and Inclusion in Eighteenth-Century British Painting"

Sir Joshua Reynolds, President of Britain’s Royal Academy, encouraged his students to steal—but only under certain conditions. An artist who imitates a pre-existing motif, he claimed, “and so accommodates it to his own work, that it makes a part of it, with no seam or joining appearing, can hardly be charged with plagiarism... Borrowing or stealing with such art or caution, will have a right to the same lenity as was used by the Lacedemonians, who did not punish theft, but the want of artifice to conceal it.” Yet Reynolds did not practice what he preached: the thinly-veiled compositional allusions to classical works in his portraits were easily identified by an elite subset of his audience. At the same time, an even more blatant type of visual reference, inclusion, appeared in the work of artists such as William Hogarth and Johann Zoffany. The presence of a “seam or joining,” to use Reynolds’s term, distinguishes an inclusion (that is, an image-within-an-image) from an allusion. Bordered by a frame, an image-within-an-image announces itself for what it is: a motif appropriated from elsewhere, an object that is one with and yet fundamentally different from the rest of the painted surface. Like the allusions advocated by Reynolds, inclusion seeks to avoid accusations of plagiarism, but through announcement rather than concealment. This paper will examine inclusions and allusions as practiced by Reynolds and his contemporaries and argue that attention to the various modes of visual reference can reveal much about the relationships between artists and about the visual abilities of their audiences.

_Jessica Seidman_
*University of Chicago*

"Modeling on ‘Zeuxis Selecting Models’: Catullus 51 and the Aesthetic of Eclecticism"

Although Catullus 51 is among the most famous poems in the author’s collection, it is unclear how much this “translation” belongs to Catullus at all: Sappho 31 is the primary source for the verses, but scholars have also detected echoes of everything from the Homeric Hymn to Diana (Knox) to the words of Phaedra in Euripides’ _Hippolytus_ (Segal) to the lament of Theocritus’ Cyclops (Wray). This paper argues that the story of ‘Zeuxis Selecting Models,’ offers a useful comparison in helping us understand Poem 51 and the aesthetic of eclecticism at its core.

According to Cicero, when Zeuxis was commissioned by the people of Croton to paint a Helen, the painter did not choose one woman to be his model, but five “because he did not think all the qualities which he sought to combine in a portrayal of beauty could be found in one person,” (Cic.Inv.2.3). The segmentation of the body of Zeuxis’ Helen parallels the description of Catullus’ disintegrated body in Poem 51. This description offers a visual metaphor for the literary disintegration the reader detects. Just as Helen was too beautiful for any one human model to capture, so the effect of Catullus’ Lesbia is too powerful for any one literary model; the poet must pull from a variety of sources to give even a sideways glance at his beloved. Catullus’ literary thefts are the very point of his poem, not some lapse in his originality that must be overlooked or forgiven.

David Wray, _Catullus and the Poetics of Roman Manhood_ (Cambridge, U.K. ; New York: Cambridge University
Melanie Subacus  
New York University  

“Translation and Appropriation of Vergil’s Aeneid”

Anxiety is inherent in translation, and the line between originality and theft becomes even more blurred in the act of retranslation. As one moves further from the text, a dual source of anxiety emerges, first the relationship between translator and source text, and then that between translator and previous translators of the same text. Vergil’s Aeneid has been translated time and again, allowing translators to engage with the text as well as with each other. The translations of John Dryden and William Wordsworth are direct examples of such literary engagement. This paper will evaluate episodes from each translation and based on Wordsworth’s explicitly negative reaction to Dryden’s Aeneid, will evaluate the conscious similarities and differences as a reflection of both literary and political anxieties.

In his letters, Wordsworth, criticized Dryden’s translation extensively and Wordsworth’s own translation of Vergil can be seen as an attempt to supplant Dryden, who — some scholars would argue — has produced the best English translation to date. In his translation, however, Wordsworth will at times appropriates language directly from Dryden. He also chooses to compose his translation in the Neo-Classical heroic couplets which Dryden uses; a marked shift from the blank verse of the Prelude. Each translator was heavily involved in contemporary politics and each produced programmatic essays on the writing of poetry. For Wordsworth, this meant an emphasis on common language and everyday experiences, much different from the affected and courtly language of Dryden. In this paper, I will examine the presence of both high and low poetic language within the Aeneid that made the translation so appealing to both poets. Wordsworth’s opposition to the affected language of Dryden’s Aeneid produces a work very different, yet explicitly connected and engaged through undisguised appropriations, than that of his Enlightenment predecessor.
The Anxiety of Influence and Appropriation
The Seventh Biennial Bryn Mawr College Graduate Group Symposium

December 4-5, 2009

Featured Respondent: Robert Nelson, Robert Lehman Professor, History of Art, Yale University

Sponsored by the Graduate Group, the Center for Visual Culture, and the Departments of Classical and Near Eastern Archaeology, Greek, Latin and Classical Studies, and History of Art

SYMPOSIUM COMMITTEE

Carrie Robbins, Co-Chair
History of Art
cmrobbins@brynmawr.edu

Johanna Gosse, Co-Chair
History of Art
jgosse@brynmawr.edu

Mary Frances Bannard, Classics
Joelle Collins, Archaeology
Nickie Colosimo, Archaeology
Lauren Crampton, Archaeology

Patrick Crowley, Archaeology
Maeve Doyle, History of Art
Lori Felton, History of Art
Jennifer Hoit, Classics